

MINUTES

REGULAR MEETING I

SWATARA TOWNSHIP

FEBRUARY 1, 2023

BOARD OF COMMISSIONERS

1. **Call to Order:** President Zubeck called the Regular Meeting I of the Swatara Township Board of Commissioners to order at 7:00 p.m. Wednesday, February 1, 2023, at the Swatara Township Municipal Building, 599 Eisenhower Boulevard, Harrisburg, PA 17111
2. **Pledge of Allegiance:** President Zubeck led the audience in the Pledge of Allegiance.
3. **Moment of Silence:** Pastor Gary Lathrop led everyone in prayer.
4. **Roll Call:** Commissioner Christine Zubeck, Jeff Varner, Shaela Ellis, Richard Boudier and Michael Tuckey were present. Also present: Assistant Manager Kim Kaufman, Solicitor Kevin Hall, Director of Public Safety and Sergeant-at-arms Darrell Reider, Deputy Chief Tom Stauffer, Lt. Dennis Krahling, Public Works Director Todd Webb, Director of Building and Codes Robert Ihlein, Fire Chief Mike Ibberson and Secretary Karen Alleman.
5. **Swearing-In of Lieutenant David L. Milsteen:** Director of Public Safety Reider gave a history of Officer David Milsteen with the Swatara Township Police Department. Magisterial District Justice Michael J. Smith swore in David Milsteen as Lieutenant of the Swatara Township Police Department. Lt. Milsteen's family were also in attendance to witness his swearing in.
6. **Announce Executive Session:** An executive session was held to discuss pending litigation.

7:15 p.m. Public Hearing: Amendment to Zoning Ordinance to Permit Auto Service Stations by Right in the C-L: Limited Commercial District

The Regular Meeting I of the Board of Commissioners recessed at 7:15 p.m. for a public hearing to amend the Zoning Ordinance to permit auto service stations by right in the C-L Limited Commercial District. The Regular Meeting I of the Board of Commissioners reconvened at 7:59 p.m.

7. **Consideration of Ordinance: Amendment to Chapter 295, Zoning to Permit Auto Service Stations by Right in the C-L Limited Commercial District, to define spanner sign, to permit certain signage on canopies and fuel dispensers located at an auto service station and to establish specific criteria for auto service stations in the C-L Limited Commercial District:** Commissioner Varner made a motion to approve an Amendment to Chapter 295, Zoning, to permit auto service stations by right in the C-L Limited Commercial District, to define spanner sign, to permit certain signage on

MINUTES

SWATARA TOWNSHIP

REGULAR MEETING I

FEBRUARY 1, 2023

BOARD OF COMMISSIONERS

regarding the process so far for the proposed building. She is willing to share the timeline through an email request to sellis@swataratwp.com. She requested a time during a regular meeting for the architect to speak with the public to go over the square footage and calculation of estimated costs. She would like an update to the capital improvements plan. Advised there is a DCNR grant for recreation and conservation projects opening. AARP is preparing taxes free of charge at the municipal building, by appointment.

- B. **Commissioner Boudier:** Nothing this evening.
- C. **Commissioner Tuckey:** In regard to the timeline that Commissioner Zubeck presented, he does not think there are any residents willing to pay \$37-38 million plus for the project to have been done. The current architect is very good and covers everything that needs to be done. As a Board, a decision was made to move forward with the plans. He commended President Zubeck and staff for work done to keep spending in check. He would like the Board to work together and move forward, not backward to something that was not working.
- D. **Vice President Varner:** Regarding transparency, he said Commissioner Ellis was willing to share plans from the former architect, but yet ironically, he could not get the plans shared with him at the time. There are currently plans posted all over the meeting room with drawings and designs for the public to view regarding the potential building. He feels the Township is in a much better position transparency wise than in the past.
- E. **President Zubeck:** Congratulated Lt. Milsteen. When she became President, there was a lot going on, and she had to find things out herself. She was on the Board for four years, and no one shared any information with her. This Board has been transparent and does everything it possibly can to share information with the public. She will work on having more information posted to Facebook.

With the prior Board, the borrowing was presented in one presentation and the borrowing was decided that night. She was not aware a vote would be taken that night. It was presented as a capital improvement plan with a building and a park, and some paving of roads. The majority of the prior board voted to allow the former president of the board to borrow up to \$26 million without any future approval of the Board. She voted against that.

She abstained from voting, along with Commissioner Varner, regarding the initial architect, because they did not receive any previous notice prior to that evening on the vote for the architect, as well as not having any information on that process. In January of 2022 she asked for information from the architect. She was told by the architect that the former president of the board told them not to share any costs about the plan, any information about the plan, share nothing with the Board of

MINUTES

REGULAR MEETING I

SWATARA TOWNSHIP
BOARD OF COMMISSIONERS

FEBRUARY 1, 2023

Commissioners, because she would have an issue with it, and she did. There was a \$37 million price tag. The former plan included a fire station, which the former architect specialized in. She asked for the process that was used to select the former architect.

Assistant Manager Kaufman said the process involved a number of individuals from the Township who reviewed all of the proposals that were received. The proposals were narrowed down, and individual interviews were conducted with about a dozen firms, and then that group was narrowed down. Recommendations were provided to Dawood Engineering, and they advised that a decision was made with regard to who the architect was going to be. To Mr. Kaufman's recollection, the general consensus of the employees was Kimmel Bogrette. The decision of the architect is ultimately made by the Commissioners, and they went with Manns Woodward. President Zubeck asked if Commissioners were part of the selection process. Mr. Kaufman was aware that in the last round of three finalists, Commissioner Connolly was involved, he did not recall who else was involved. President Zubeck asked if firms were reduced to three, and then the Commissioners became involved, and then someone else, other than the consensus, was chosen. Mr. Kaufman said in any type of situation like that, when asked, you provide your opinion. Ultimately, the Commissioners get to make the final call. President Zubeck said she values the opinion of the consensus of the staff. She thinks the opinion of the staff should have meant something.

The scenario was a building at \$42 million, prior to inflation, and bond money had already been taken out, you cannot turn back. This Board is doing the best it can to mitigate costs. The fire station, which was the bulk of the project, was taken out of the original plan, which only included public works, police, fire and EOC and did not include site work. The project now before the Board includes administration, police and EOC, public works and all the site work for between a rough estimate of \$26-28 million, with inflation. That is certainly cheaper than \$42 million.

Another presentation by the current architect will be held on March 1 prior to the meeting, beginning at 5:30 p.m. Kimmel Bogrette and Ed Black Associates will give presentations and be available to answer questions. Tours of the building will be available.

15. **Adjournment:** Commissioner Tuckey made a motion to adjourn the meeting at 8:30 p.m., seconded by Commissioner Ellis. Motion carried unanimously.



Karen Alleman, Township Secretary

COST ESTIMATE SUMMARY

7/6/2021

Project Title: Swatara Township Public Safety Complex

Anticipated Construction Period: 03/2022 – 09/2023 (18 months)

Anticipated Estimated Mid-point of Construction: 12/2022

Public Safety Building Construction

Building Cost: \$18,045,969 Gross Building SF: 51,840 Cost per GSF: \$348

Fire @ 21,284 gsf = \$6,620,299

Police @ 25,659 gsf = \$9,432,559

EOC/Shared @ 5,058 gsf = \$1,993,111

Highways Building Construction

Building Cost: \$4,172,493 Gross Building SF: 23,891 Cost per GSF: \$175

Small Vehicle Storage @ 4,190 gsf = \$793,715

Salt Storage & Large Vehicle Storage @ 15,869 gsf = \$2,834,300

Wash Bay & Large Vehicle Storage @ 2,012 gsf = \$544,478

Sitework

Site Cost: \$2,827,636 Area: 5.57 acres

Earthwork = \$740,000

Demolition, Site Improvements & Utilities = \$2,087,636

Subtotal of Estimated Costs: \$25,046,098

Design Contingency @ 10% = \$2,504,610

Subtotal = \$27,550,708

Escalation @ 3% per 12 months for 18 months = \$1,239,782

Total Construction Cost = \$28,790,490

Building Project Timeline

Dates Correspond with BOC Meeting Minutes

- June 10, 2020 – Unanimous vote to explore potential borrowing
- July 8, 2020 – 3 to 2 vote referred to during February 1, 2023 comments made by President Zubeck for borrowing not to exceed \$26 million
- August 12, 2020 – Unanimous vote for Township Engineering firm to prepare an RFP (Request for Proposal) for design services and proposed building renovations
- November 4, 2020 – Property acquisition for Rainbow Hills Swim Club approved unanimously
- November 11, 2020 – 4 to 1 vote to approve Capital Improvement Plan, \$17.695 million is the amount that the township is responsible for paying back, 20 million received due to the township's excellent financial situation
- December 9, 2020 – 3 yes votes and 2 abstentions to award professional service contract to Manns Woodward to design Municipal Complex Building (most recent draft of building plan received 1/13/22)
- April 6, 2022 – Manns Woodward contract terminated and 3rd place firm Kimmel-Bogrette engaged

Seven firms were interviewed by a Committee that consisted of Manager Fosselman, Assistant Manager Kauffman, Public Safety Director Reider, Public Works Director Webb, Fire Chief Ibberson, and Facilities Maintenance Technician Orth.

Scoring developed by Dawood Engineering, first round scores as follows (see attached PDF provided by Dawood):

1. Murray Associates Architects – 91
2. Manns Woodward Studios Inc. – 91
3. Kimmel-Bogrette Architecture – 86

Top three firms interviewed a second time on November 17, 2020. Discussion with the Committee took place November 25, 2020 with Murray and Manns still in the top two. Costs evaluated by myself and Former Finance Chair Connolly. Email notification sent to committee on December 1, 2020 confirming Manns Woodward selection.

Cost estimate dated July 6, 2021 that included construction and site work - \$28,790,490.00 included for public review.

	Total Range of Points	0-10	0-10	0-10	0-15	0-15	0-15	0-5	0-20	100
	Evaluation Criteria	Budget and Schedule	Did the firm adequately discuss how it will keep the project on schedule?	How well did the firm discuss their proposed approach and propose budget as it relates to their proposed level of effort?	Engagement Strategy with the Township Staff	Experience with the Various Elements of the Project (Public Safety, Public Works, and Administration Building)	Did the firm discuss how it will evaluate the conditions of the existing administrative building?	Did the firm address how it will integrate the existing buildings on the site with any proposed new buildings (so they all look the same)?	Did the firm share any preliminary ideas/concepts for the proposed layout of the project on the site based on the RFP and the pre-proposal meeting?+Public Works Portion of the Project	Average Total Score
Murray Associates Architects	Average Total Score	10	9	9	14	14	13	5	17	91
Manns Woodward Studios, Inc.	Average Total Score	9	8	9	14	15	12	5	19	91
Kimmel Bogrette Architecture + Site	Average Total Score	10	8	8	14	14	12	4	16	86
CDI Architects Group LLC	Average Total Score	8	9	9	12	13	12	4	15	82
USA Architects, Planners + Interior Designers, P.A	Average Total Score	8	8	7	13	11	12	5	12	77
Murphy & Dittenhafer, Inc.	Average Total Score	8	8	8	13	10	13	3	13	76
Buchart Horn, Inc.	Average Total Score	7	7	8	12	12	12	3	13	74